

Implementing Ukrainian Law on Higher Education: Successes and Challenges

For two years starting from the second part of 2014 and till the mid-2016 a thorough work on implementation of the Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education” was done by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, particularly in the part of elaboration and adoption of the number of by-laws (over 30 resolutions and orders of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine and more than 60 orders of the Ministry) and also regarding meetings, seminars, training sessions with representatives of higher education institutions and student self-government. It is important to understand that this was possible thanks to the fundamental position of the team of Kyiv-Mohyla Academy, which worked at the Ministry in those days.

First of all, I would like to start with introducing the story of the Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education”, make an overview of these by-laws, then go to the main problems that have emerged during implementation, tell about conservative reaction to the Law and its implementation in the second part of 2016 year and, finally, to focus on the issue of academic quality assurance in post-secondary institutions in Ukraine.

Progressive Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education” (2014)

Story with adoption of the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" is a good example of how academic community and student activists can achieve the realization of their aspirations even in extremely adverse circumstances. Actual work on it began with opposition to attempts of Viktor Yanukovich regime to impose in Ukraine the Russian style of governance in various fields, including higher education. This model reflects the following main principles: total centralization, mutual distrust, political loyalty. In November 2010 a current Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine Dmytro Tabachnyk presented the Bill "On Higher Education" which was based on the principles of centralization, more rigid than in Soviet times. His purpose was to build a power structure: the President of Ukraine – the Minister of Education – the Rector. And no space was left for university autonomy and freedom of speech.

The only Kyiv-Mohyla Academy publicly opposed such legislative initiatives. Tabachnyk expected his Bill to be endorsed in the Parliament by the beginning of 2011. All-Ukrainian mass protest campaign called “Against the degradation of Education” took place since 2010 to 2013, organized mainly by public youth organizations and student self-government.

In the 2012-2013 intentionally created working group was involved in the elaboration of the text and then in promoting of the draft law "On Higher Education". In the result, the victory of the Revolution of Dignity enabled its adoption. The new Law was approved by the Parliament on July 1 and then came in force on September 6, 2014. It is based on the concept of comprehensive university autonomy: academic, financial and organizational. The third cycle of education (the PhD level) was introduced by the Law, which also emphasized the necessity of the interdisciplinarity, integration of higher education and scientific researches, protection of intellectual property, internationalization, etc.

Disadvantages of the Law were associated with the main principle of the working group - consensus. Since it was important to maintain the unity of all stakeholders (universities, the Academies of Sciences, students, employers, trade unions, independent experts, etc.) in opposition to the political regime, it was decided to bypass discussing all sensitive issues, unacceptable for at least one stakeholder, through the reaching consensus.

For example, student scholarships were provided on the level of minimum cost of living, which is impossible for different reasons; beside with establishing of PhD were left a soviet concept of Doctor of Science (was held a weak analogy with Doctor habilitated in Germany and Poland); as well as post-Soviet doctorantura, completely useless against the background of structured PhD programs, was maintained.

Later during the implementation, we had seen that it was impossible to convince all members of the academic community in need for various reforms which cause dramatic changes, because in one way or another that would affect someone's important (according to current professional culture) interests, including corruption ones.

Extremely interesting debates and discussions, that then continued on-line, were taking place at the Kyiv Polytechnical University. Anyone could join the working group, which considered about 4000 proposals and amendments to the text of the Bill offered by more than 100 different organizations. Adoption by the Verkhovna Rada (Parliament) of Ukraine of the Law "On Higher Education" in the summer of 2014 brought the new task to the agenda - its implementation that would change the way of academic life.

The implementation of main provisions of the Law

It is important to stress that ideologically a concept of comprehensive university autonomy doesn't mean the presence of special neoliberal policy in reformation of higher education in Ukraine. The Ministry of Education and Science could agree with some ideas of the International Monetary Fund only in terms of optimization of inadequate networks of educational institutions at all levels and establishment of the correspondence between offers of the national education and research system and needs of industry and labor market. We also aimed to refuse from the total state control over the universities' activity. Ukraine inherited all these problems from the Soviet era.

I have underlined that priorities of our team were: universal access to quality education; the decentralization of governance; the autonomy of educational institutions; deregulation; reduction in bureaucracy; public-private partnership and state-community managementⁱ. At the same time, the role of the state in ensuring of social justice, responsibility for educational reforms in atmosphere of openness and accountability should be substantial. The liberalization of relations in higher education and research has to be consistent with the development of the national economy, increasing academic culture and international competitiveness of Ukrainian universities.

The temptation to jump from post-Soviet feudalism in higher education to unlimited liberalism threatens a deepening of corruption and strengthening of the same feudal relations, to which we shall return. The state should be responsible for forming and holding steady policy in higher education and research aimed at raising of the quality and international integration of Ukrainian universities, including the providing the comprehensive university autonomy. On the other hand, universities will be responsible for their own quality. They know best how to do it and therefore must be protected from any political or bureaucratic pressure.

So, starting from the 2015-2016 academic year a new list of fields of studies and narrow fields of studiesⁱⁱ is valid in Ukraine. The goal of the Ministry of Education and Science was to bring the Ukrainian list in line with modern international standards. This is one of the key documents necessary for the reformation of the learning process.

The Soviet Government considered of a university teacher as of a person who just informs the students about something in a classroom. Personal professional growth, participation in research and conferences, publications,

even preparing for work with students were not taken into account. That's why in the Soviet Union and still in Ukraine, in comparison with Western universities, was far more (two or even three times more) number of disciplines to teach. Accordingly, number of fields of studies and narrow fields of studies was forced to be increased.

What have we done? We reduced this number and gave to universities the right to approve their own curricula. Now a license is granted for common narrow fields of studies and then universities' study programs (specializations) must be accredited. We reduced the teachers' workload (from 900 to 600 hours per year) and students' ones (30 instead of 36 hours per credit). With enormous efforts a real practice when the students choose elective courses is being introduced gradually.

The new procedure for awarding of academic titles was approvedⁱⁱⁱ. We can see an internationalization of this process. For the first time the level of proficiency in English is set not lower than B2. International training and publications in peer-reviewed journals are required. Such steps are intended to overcome long-standing policy of self-isolation of Ukraine cultivated since Soviet times. There are many unknown to anyone so-called scientific journals in Ukraine, which no one reads them except the authors. Or, it can be said that the authors are looking for reading just their own articles. Therefore, the policy of the Ministry encourages Ukrainian academic institutions to promote their journals in professional databases, first of all such as Scopus and Web of Science, and also researchers to publish their works in international peer-reviewed journals.

The system of training PhD and doctors also was changed^{iv}. The main goal is the same – internationalization and increasing the overall professional level of researchers. Now, unlike the Soviet postgraduate, new PhD programs (the third cycle of higher education) have intensive learning process with special emphasis on English. Two tutors can work with one PhD student, the students have to conduct their own research, participate in international conferences and communicate with foreign colleagues, publish the results of their research in peer-reviewed journals. These changes were based on experience of Doctoral School of Kyiv-Mohyla Academy, founded in 2008.

The process of the development and implementation of new standards of higher education has started^v. For this purpose, the procedure for competitive selection of members of the scientific-methodological council and scientific-methodological commissions of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine was stipulated, also were prepared guidelines to develop new

standards for higher education. These standards include requirements for the content and results of educational activities at each level of higher education within each narrow field (including the number of credits of the European Credit Transfer System, the list of competencies, normative content of training formulated in terms of learning results, requirements for availability of the system of internal education quality assurance). Associations of employers play an important role in shaping standards of higher education.

Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine abolished all regulations that restrict or prevent implementation of the principle of academic autonomy of universities^{vi}, as well as those that set some mandatory courses regardless of narrow fields. The obligatoriness of educational-professional programs of the standards of higher education was changed to recommended status. Previously these programs have set the list of mandatory disciplines for specific areas of training. The practice of such forcing and compulsory dates back to Soviet times, when ideological "Marxism-Leninism» disciplines were mandatory. Based on new standards of higher education today universities have to determine their own curricula. With a purpose of the proper implementation of the Law in part of introduction of elective courses the All-Ukrainian meeting was held in May 2016, where different models of variable component were presented. Materials for the meeting were sent to all higher education institutions, and the corresponding video was posted on the Internet. Actually similar arrangements accompanied all key aspects of implementation.

Academic mobility^{vii} is very important component of modern higher education, affecting its internationalization. In addition to the adopting of necessary implementing documents, the Ministry holds special arrangements for vice-rectors and heads of international departments of universities, clarifies various issues regarding academic mobility, foreign students, the recognition of education documents, as well as opportunities to participate in European Union programs "Erasmus +" and "Horizon 2020". Academic mobility of Ukrainian students was provided by the relevant regulations. It is important that understanding of academic mobility and internationalization of higher education as one of the main objectives of the Bologna process is gradually growing in Ukraine. And of course there can be no academic mobility without knowledge of English.

Within rejection of Soviet rules were abolished mandatory three years of working^{viii} in government organizations and enterprises after the completion of higher education paid by government. This rule was absurd for three reasons. Firstly, the bigger part of state budget revenues come from private

enterprises and not from state ones. Secondly, this rule very closely reminds serfdom, abolished in the nineteenth century. Thirdly, after the collapse of the Soviet Union, it almost did not work. However, universities and various bureaucratic agencies' reports about such practice continued to accumulate. The Ministry confirmed the right of graduates to make their own choice of work place.

A number of important steps of the Ministry and the Government deepened organizational and particularly personnel (staffing) autonomy^{ix} of Ukrainian universities. We have to make such emphasis, because of the experience of previous practice of the Ministry's intervention in staffing issues of higher education institutions. Among the priority issues are: open and transparent elections of rectors, organization of the work of admission committees, student's transfer, and the opportunity to issue own diplomas, and in the future – a complete rejection of state patronage of operational universities' activities. Opportunities for foreigners and stateless persons to obtain higher education in Ukraine were expanded. Procedures of issuing invitations and long-term visas were approved, as well as grounds for implementation of universities' legal, organizational, financial autonomy rights were developed.

Special attention was paid to documents on higher education^x, because along with the rejection of "state diplomas", there was a need to regulate the mandatory information that must contain every university diploma. Procedures for recognition of foreign diplomas, documents on higher theological education, degrees and academic titles, issued by theological education establishments were developed as well.

A number of documents were adopted to strengthen the Unified State Education Electronic Database^{xi}. This database concentrates all data about the movement of students from school graduation to obtaining higher educational diplomas. Educational documents are issued on its basis. The Unified State Education Electronic Database enables to verify the authenticity of student ID, diploma or certificate on-line anytime. One of examples of preventing corruption activity is regaining of state control over the issuance of educational documents and student ID, maintaining the Unified State Education Electronic Database, and decentralization of documents production.

It is all about elimination of artificial monopoly created with the purpose of private enrichment^{xii}. Monopoly made educational documents more expensive than they can actually be. We anticipate that in the future, with

development of university autonomy, accumulation of experience, increasing professional responsibility, all information about issued diplomas will be available online exclusively on universities websites.

The next step aimed to implement university autonomy was to ensure openness and transparency of higher education establishments' activities^{xiii} through publication on university websites some important information. In particular, the mandatory requirements are to post the statute of the university, budget, and manning table, provision of organization of learning process, provision of Academic Council and its decisions, provision of the admission committee.

The Ministry has paid proper attention to the development of the external independent testing system^{xiv} through which applicants can get to the universities, and clarified the conditions of admission to universities^{xv}. Previously external independent testing served only school graduates who wanted to enter the undergraduate programs, but this year a successful experiment was conducted by testing for admission to master programs in law throughout all country. In today Ukraine the system of external independent evaluation is the only way to be accepted to the university because it minimizes the threat of corruption at admission. In the future, along with decreasing the number (currently we have up to 1,000 universities and their branches) and improving the quality and competitiveness of Ukrainian universities, they will have the right to nominate their own requirements for applicants, besides testing certificates.

The Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine always takes care of universities evacuated from the occupied territories^{xvi}. There are 16 such universities and 10 research Institutes of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine that also were moved. Mostly, they stayed on the territory of the Donetsk and Lugansk regions controlled by Ukrainian government. After all, teachers and students want to be closer to their homes that they were forced to leave. However, some moved further west. For example, Vasyl Stus Donetsk National University functions in Vynnytsia. Displaced universities mostly are very active and participate in many international programs. They have created own Council of rectors. Applicants from occupied territories prefer to apply to these universities.

Implementation of financial autonomy^{xvii} is perhaps the most difficult task facing the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine. Because undeclared war continues in Ukraine, the situation in the economy is only beginning to change for the better. Therefore, there is the need to maintain a

special control over all state resources. In particular, finances are allocated through the State Treasury - a relic of the Stalinist system. It still saves all university funds. We are mentioning state universities more often, as private universities don't make serious competition yet. In particular, they don't conduct any research and mostly accept not the best applicants, but those who can afford to pay tuition fees. Now state universities can open accounts in banks and private universities have the right to receive state support for their best competitive programs. The list of paid university services is significantly expanded; requirements for "typical manning table" were canceled.

With the purpose to reject the Stalinist system of funding universities, which relied on the concept of government order, the Ministry has developed the Bill "On amendments to some laws of Ukraine concerning the financing of higher education (regarding economic relations in higher education)." We want to move away from the centralized allocation practice (often manual) of scholarships for a certain number of students in all state universities (the best and the worst, without a clear methodology) and go to the funding only the best universities. Under the new conditions, they will have a basic university funding necessary for its sustenance, also the social fund, development fund and the state target support fund.

The development of student self-government^{xviii} is one of priorities of higher education development in Ukraine. Therefore, the Ministry not only issued necessary regulations, but also held arrangements and trainings with leaders of student self-government; encouraged them actively protect student's interests and collaborate with other management factors in higher education, conducted explanatory work with the university administration. Because the implementation of the principles of university autonomy is possible only with the active and demanding university communities, including students.

Significant changes were introduced in the system of licensing and accreditation^{xix}. They were focused on the general clarity of the procedure, simplification and elimination of unnecessary bureaucracy, but at the same time also at preserving of rigorous requirements with regard to quality. According to the Law "On Higher Education", these tasks are responsibility of an independent the National Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education. But here we have to go to the challenges and threats.

Conservative reaction to reforms and other threats

According to the Law "On Higher Education", the elections to the National Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education were held in June 2015. Due to the fact that they were corrupt, as Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine I did not recognize their results and suggested to make amendments to the Law, specifying election procedure and requirements for the candidates, and only after that to hold new elections^{xx}. Because the draft law "On Higher Education" was created in adverse terms of opposition of academic community to the Ministry of Education and the political regime, the goal of the developers was to protect academic freedom and interests of universities from the tyranny of the Ministry. Now other tasks have arisen in spotlight, such as protection of the academic community from corrupt Agency.

There is a temptation to concentrate in the one hands a great power, simultaneously related to licensing, accreditation, ensuring the quality of higher education, defending dissertations, providing academic integrity. This is a big threat for reforms in Ukrainian higher education. After all, the purpose to create the Agency was establishment of the new powerful body of competent experts instead of corrupt bureaucrats' units. Media posted information about detected plagiarism in scientific publications of several members of the Agency, including those who intended to become a chairman. However, despite introduced by the Ministry in 2014 practice of depriving academic degrees for plagiarism, the fact of plagiarism still does not mean the end of professional career in Ukrainian politics, government or academic society.

We have other evidences of attempts of conservative reaction to reforms. Thus, on August 12, 2016, Kyiv Union of University Rectors appealed to the Minister of Education and Science with request to revise a number of provisions of the Law "On Higher Education", particularly those related to the organization of learning and teaching processes. Union of Rectors also stated that did not support a number of specifications to this Law, the need for which appeared during its implementation. In particular, regarding clarification of election procedures and requirements for members of the National Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education^{xxi}. The main purpose of this letter was a signal that the Ministry should not hurry up with reformation of Ukrainian higher education. They think that maybe it was not so bad until now.

We have very similar situation with sabotage in implementation of the law "On science and research" (2015), including needed structural and organizational changes within the National Academy of Sciences and mutual integration of learning process at the universities and research. Of course, it will make new problems and challenges for the society.

Here is another example. The decision of the Kyiv District Administrative Court on September 7 suddenly canceled requirements of publication in international peer-reviewed journals and knowledge of English at level B2 for obtaining academic degrees^{xxii}. The current Ukrainian courts can make amazing decisions. Therefore, it is important to keep trend for openness and collaboration with global academic community, talking in common language, remembering only about international quality criteria in cooperation and competition. The problem is that the Ministry of education and science is really trying to reduce the requirements on English language competence and other demands for Ukrainian internationalization in higher education and research.

Conclusions

Only principle position of the Ukrainian academic community can give a new impulse to the reform of higher education. More specifically, it is about the desire of Ukrainian universities to move towards full autonomy and responsibility, as higher education reform is the reformation of universities themselves. Autonomous Universities are not synonymous to feudal fiefdoms, with subsistence economy and dominance of post-Soviet management practices that have nothing common with the essence of the modern higher educational institutions.

Based on these examples of implementation of the progressive Law "On Higher Education", that was elaborated and supported by Ukrainian academic community, and following conservative reaction to it, the best suggestion would be to offer many specific initiatives aimed at steady implementation of its rules and changes in Ukrainian academic life. Therefore, Kyiv-Mohyla Academy (KMA) established of own Center for Academic Quality Assurance by the decision of the University Senate on 24 June 2016. There are no similar centers in Ukraine.

The Center will conduct the following activities:

1. Students surveys on the quality of teaching and quality of the study programs and courses.

2. Faculties (instructors and faculty members) surveys on the academic process organization and on the University management quality.

3. Employers survey on the quantity and quality of knowledge and skills they request from their new employees, quality of the KMA graduates in particular.

4. KMA alumni surveys about the quality and impact of the educational experiences at KMA. This survey will also collect the KMA graduates' suggestions on the possible improvements of the KMA educational process.

5. Participation in the improvement of KMA study programs also planned be important part of the Center's activity.

6. Professional development of teachers.

7. It will be responsible for academic integrity issues at the KMA;

8. Additionally the Center will gather statistic information about the University performance, e.g. its participation in the national and international rankings, dynamics of the students and faculty quality, violations of academic integrity.

The Center for Quality Assurance will collaborate with the similarly newly created KMA Quality Assurance Committee made of the representatives of all the KMA academic units, as well as of student body representatives. KMA Quality Assurance Committee reports to the University Senate and has a task to draft the KMA policies and procedures on the internal quality control and assurance. The KMA community recognizes the Center and the Committee's activities as an important step towards the University corporate culture development.

We are finding this project to be of the national significance as Ukrainian universities are currently lacking effective internal quality assurance procedures, as well as quality assurance units in place. At the same time there is also no proper external quality assessment system in Ukraine, while development of both internal and external academic quality assurance should be based on the autonomous universities' needs and to be the initiated by universities first of all. The current problem is that since two years Ukraine has got favorable educational legislation, but the Ukrainian universities neither have any relevant experience so far, nor recognize quality evaluation and assurance as an effective tool for their own development.

The Center has two main tasks: provision of real instruments for the internal quality control and assurance at Kyiv-Mohyla Academy, and creation of the best model of internal academic quality assurance, applicable for other Ukrainian universities. The model should be functional and which will consider current situation of multiple changes in the Ukrainian higher

education system according to the provisions of the new Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education".

References:

ⁱ Serhiy Kvit (2015) The Battlefield of Civilizations: Education in Ukraine. – Kyiv, PH “Kyiv-Mohyla Academy”. – P. 147.

ⁱⁱ Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated April 29, 2015, # 266 "On approval of the list of fields of studies and narrow fields of studies, which train candidates of higher education"; order of MES of Ukraine, dated November 6, 2015, # 1151 "On features of introduction the list of fields of studies and narrow fields of studies, which train candidates of higher education, approved by the resolution of CMU, dated April 29, 2015, # 266", registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on November 25, 2015 # 1460/27905; order of MES of Ukraine April, dated 12, 2016, # 419 "On amending the order of MES of Ukraine, dated November 6, 2015, # 1151", registered in the Ministry of Justice on May 6, 2016 # 691/28821 (amending the table of correspondences of the list of fields of studies and narrow fields of studies).

ⁱⁱⁱ CMU Resolution, dated August 19, 2015, # 656 "Some issues of implementation of Article 54 of the Law of Ukraine " On Higher Education " about awarding academic titles of professor, associate professor, senior researcher"; order of MES of Ukraine, dated January 14, 2016, # 13 "On approval of the Procedure of awarding of academic titles to scientific and pedagogical staff", registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on February 3, 2016 # 183/28313. Ministry supported by the Office of the Fulbright Program in Ukraine conducted training "How to publish in international peer-reviewed journals» in Kyiv, Kharkiv, Lviv, Odessa. Also about 2,000 persons had online training.

^{iv} Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated March 23, 2016, # 261 "On approval of the Procedure of training of higher education applicants PhD degree and doctorate in higher education (research institutions)"; MES order, dated July 14, 2015, # 758 "On publication of theses and reviews official opponents," registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on July 22, 2015 # 885/2733.

^v Order of MES of Ukraine, dated October 27, 2015, # 1115 "On amendments to the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine of September 11, 2015 # 922", which established the Scientific and Methodological Council of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine and approved relevant regulations; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated November 27, 2015, # 1246 registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on November 11, 2015 # 1542/27987 «On approval of the Procedure of competitive selection of members of the Scientific and Methodological Council and scientific-methodical commissions of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine"; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated November 26, 2015, # 1226 "On establishment of the tender committee for the selection of candidates to the Scientific and Methodological Council of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine"; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated January 14, 2016, # 15 "On announcement of competitive selection of members of the Scientific and Methodological Council of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine"; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated January 26, 2016, # 53 "On announcement of competitive selection of the members of scientific-methodical commissions (sub) of Higher Education Sector of Scientific and Methodological Council of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine"; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated April 6, 2016 # 375 "On approval of the

membership of Scientific-methodical commissions (sub) of Higher Education sector of Scientific and Methodological Council of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine." Guidelines on the development of higher education standards were approved. It was also sent a number of explanatory letters and held trainings on the development of higher education standards. It is already developed a part of higher education standards and ready for public discussion and external expertise.

^{vi} Order of MES of Ukraine, dated January 26, 2015, # 47 «On peculiarities of formation curricula in 2015/2016 academic year»; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated March 4, 2015, # 235 " On recognition of the void orders of MES of Ukraine (dated October 20, 2004, # 811" On introduction in higher education establishments the course "Intellectual Property"; dated May 21, 2004, # 414 "On introduction in higher education establishments the discipline "Higher education and the Bologna process"); Order of MES of Ukraine, dated November 9, 2015, #1152 "On recognition of the void order of MES of Ukraine, dated May 24, 2013, # 584" registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on November 23, 2015, #1457 / 27902 (were canceled provisions about establishment and organization of the state examination Commission in the higher education establishments of Ukraine "); Order of MES of Ukraine, dated December 28, 2015, # 1363 "On recognition of the void order of MES of Ukraine, dated December 8, 1995, #340», registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on January 14, 2016 # 55/28185 (was repealed provision about organization of external studies at higher educational establishments of Ukraine); Order of MES of Ukraine, dated December 28, 2015, #1364 «On recognition of the void some orders" (were canceled orders of MES of Ukraine, dated July 31, 1998, # 285 "On the procedure of development components of regulatory and educational providing of training in higher education"). Before the adoption of the Law at the same time there were some documents that regulated the organization of educational process in universities that were contrary to the principles of autonomy and triggered conflicts in their practical use, namely: Order of MES of Ukraine, dated December 30, 2005, # 774 "On introduction of credit-modular system of organization of educational process ", Order of MES of Ukraine, dated February 6, 1993, #161 "Regulation on the organization of educational process in higher education establishments", Order of MES of Ukraine, dated January 23, 2004, # 48 "Temporary Regulation on the organization of educational process in the credit-modular system of training specialists ", Order of MES of Ukraine, dated October 16, 2009, # 943 "Guidelines on implementation of the European Credit Transfer System and its key elements". Given the above, MES of Ukraine abolished the Order, dated December 30, 2005, # 774, which obliged all universities to introduce credit-modular system of educational process on specific areas (courses) and other documents related to this issue.

^{vii} CMU Resolution, dated August 12, 2015, # 579 "On approval of the Procedure of the right to academic mobility"; order # 1184, dated November 18, 2015, "On amendments to the technical requirements for the hardware and software of Unified State Education Electronic Database " to provide a Unified State Education Electronic Database accounting training higher education applicants on program of academic mobility. Ministry conducted three expanded arrangements on internationalization of higher education for vice-rectors and heads of international departments. They discussed issues of academic mobility, foreign students training, the recognition of education documents, as well as opportunities to participate in EU programs Erasmus + and Horizon 2020. Also, in cooperation with the national center of academic mobility - ENIC UKRAINE in Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv was held meeting with heads of universities on recognition of foreign diplomas of education.

^{viii} CMU Resolution, dated April 15, 2015, # 216 "On amendments to the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated August 22, 1996, # 992, which canceled provision on

mandatory working and compensation; was sent a letter # 1/9-309, dated June 26, 2015, with thorough explanation.

^{ix} CMU Resolution, dated December 5, 2014, # 726 “Specific issues of implementation of Article 42 of the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" (adopted Guidelines on the specifics of the electoral system and procedure for the election of the head of higher education establishment, as well as the standard form of contract with the head of state higher education establishment); Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated December 23, 2015, # 1109 "On approval of the list of qualifying categories and pedagogical titles of teachers and the procedure of their awarding "; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated October 5, 2015, # 1005 "On approval of recommendations on the competitive selection of replacement of vacant posts of scientific and pedagogical staff and conclusion of their employment agreements (contracts) "; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated October 7, 2015, # 1015 "On recognition of the void order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, dated December 24, 2002, #744; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated June 17, 2016, #688 «On approval of the ballot and election commission protocol of the election of the head of higher education establishment".

^x CMU Resolution, dated March 31, 2015, # 193 "On documents on higher education (degrees) of state standard"; order of MES of Ukraine, dated May 12, 2015, # 525 "On approval of forms of higher education (degrees) documents of state standard and annexes, academic transcripts sample" registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on May 18, 2015 # 551/26996; Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated August 19, 2015, # 652 "On state recognition of higher theological education documents, degrees and academic titles issued by higher theological education establishments"; Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, dated April 8, 2016, # 381 "Some issues of state recognition of documents on higher theological education, degrees and academic titles" registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on May 5, 2016 # 678/28808, about Regulations of the Commission on state recognition of higher theological education documents and the Regulations of the Commission on state recognition of documents of degrees and academic titles; MES order, dated June 22, 2016, #701 «On amendments to the order of MES of Ukraine, dated May 12, 2015, #525» (forms of documents on higher education); order of MES, dated May 5, 2015, # 504 "Some issues of recognition in Ukraine of foreign documents on education" registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on May 27, 2015 # 614/27059.

^{xi} CMU Resolution, dated April 15, 2015, # 229 "On amendments to the Regulations on the Unified State Education Electronic Database "; MES order, dated March 6, 2015, #249 "On approval of Rules for individuals' and entities' access to the Register of documents on higher education and Rules for placing the order to create information reproduced in documents on higher education, and accounting of documents on higher education in the Unified State Education Electronic Database"; MES order, dated July 22, 2015, #787 «Regarding the timely introduction of information to USEED (the Unified State Education Electronic Database)”; MES order, dated November 18, 2015, #1184 «On amendments to the technical requirements for the hardware and software of the Unified State Education Electronic Database”; MES order, dated June 17, 2016, # 693 "On approval of the Regulation on the Register of higher education establishments of the Unified State Education Electronic Database”.

^{xii} Information of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine about establishment and operation of the Unified State Database on education and the state enterprise "Inforesurs" for the Committee on Science and Education of Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine, March 16, 2016: <https://goo.gl/oUiQal>

^{xiii} Order of MES of Ukraine, dated February 19, 2015, #166 «Some issues of disclosure of information about activities of higher education establishments"; was sent a number of explanatory letters.

^{xiv} CMU Resolution, dated December 9, 2015, # 1013 "On regulation of wage structure, features of indexation and amendments to some legislative acts"; CMU Resolution, dated July 8, 2015, # 533, which approved the new regulation on UCEQA and the procedure of external independent evaluation and monitoring the quality of education; MES order, dated October 1, 2014, # 1121 "On the program of external independent evaluation for persons who want to obtain higher education after completing secondary education"; MES order, dated January 15, 2016, # 20 registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on March 2, 2016 #180/28310 approved the new edition of the Regulation on public observation of external independent evaluation of educational achievements of graduates of secondary schools; MES order, dated December 29, 2014, # 1529 "On approval of samples of the Certificate of external testing and its information card, and their technical description" registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on January 19, 2015 #66 / 26511; Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated April 15, 2015, # 222 approved the Procedure for involving teachers, researchers and other professionals for the external evaluation; MES order, dated February 3, 2015, # 85 "On the order of using premises of education institutions for the EIT" registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on February 18, 2015 #175 / 26620.

^{xv} CMU Resolution, dated May 11, 2016, # 333 "On recognition of the void some resolutions of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine"; MES order, dated October 15, 2015, # 1085 "On approval Rules of admission to the higher education institutions of Ukraine in 2016", registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine November on 4, 2015 # 1351/27796; in November 2015 and in June 2016. Ministry held a number of regional meetings with representatives of universities about organization of admission in 2016.

^{xvi} CMU Resolution, dated October 13, 2015, # 935 "Some issues of state higher education establishments, displaced from the area of anti-terrorist operation"; MES order, dated January 26, 2016, # 50 "On establishment of the Board of rectors of higher education institutions which are temporarily displaced from the zone of anti-terrorist operation; MES order, dated May 24, 2016, # 560 "On approval of admission to obtain higher and vocational education of persons residing in the temporarily occupied territory of Ukraine", registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on May 31, 2016 # 795/28925; MES order, dated June 14, 2016 # 667 "On approval of the list of authorized higher education establishments" (a list of universities that can accept students residing in the temporarily occupied territory).

^{xvii} CMU Resolution, dated September 2, 2015, # 719 "Issue of own revenues of state and public higher education establishments, scientific and cultural institutions"; Order of MES of Ukraine, dated October 13, 2015, # 1082 "On recognition of the void the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, dated January 11, 2014 # 26" (abolition typical staff standards); CMU Resolution, dated August 19, 2015 # 634 "On approval of the contract about providing educational services between the higher education establishment and individual (entity)"; CMU Resolution, dated May 20, 2015, # 305 "On amendments to the Resolution of Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated August 27, 2010, # 796" ("On approval of the list of paid services that may be provided by education establishments, other institutions and education institutions that belong to the state and municipal property"); CMU Resolution, dated August 26, 2015, # 657 "On approval of placing by higher and vocational education institutions on deposit accounts in banks of state sector temporarily free budget funds received for paid services. "Ministry also developed the Bill "On amending some laws of Ukraine concerning the financing of higher education (regarding economic relations in higher education)." The Bill was discussed

with representatives of the public, letters were sent to heads of higher education establishments, were held a number of meetings, round table discussions with experts, debates, scientific conferences, was approved by the Board of MES and created a special section on the site of MES of Ukraine "The new model of university funding."

^{xviii} A number of explanatory letters on various areas of student self-government organizations (some issues of activity, organization of elections, funding, approval of decisions by bodies of student self-government, living in student residence, etc.); order of MES, dated September 16, 2015, # 938 « On recognition of the void the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, dated November 15, 2007, " On approval of the Regulation of student self- government "; were held two all-Ukrainian meetings with representatives of the SSO from all Ukraine, series of trainings for SSO from Kharkiv, Odesa, Cherkasy, Kirovohrad, Odessa, Lviv, Volyn, Zakarpattia, Ivano-Frankivsk, Khmelnytsky and Chernivtsi regions; was created a section at the site of MES of Ukraine with all useful and explanatory materials for students, was collected from all universities information about activities of the student self-government, were analyzed and sent clarifying letters in working order.

^{xix} Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated December 30, 2015, # 1187 "On approval of licensing conditions for educational activities of education institutions"; Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, dated December 23, 2015, # 1117 "On approval of the form of certificate of accreditation of educational program, rules of registration, renewal, issuance, storage and records of certificates"; MES order, dated April 8, 2016, # 389 "On licensing of educational activities on third education and research level "; MES order, dated February 25, 2016, #163 «On introduction to USEED (the Unified State Education Electronic Database) of information about MES of Ukraine solution for licensing of educational activities”.

^{xx} Serhiy Kvit (2016). National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education: expectations and reality <https://goo.gl/CocY4Z>

^{xxi} Letter of the Union of Rectors of Kyiv Universities to the Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine Liliya Hrynevych (# 82 / CP, dated August 12, 2016).

^{xxii} Resolution of the District Administrative Court in Kyiv # 826/11279/16, dated September 7, 2016.